

Municipality of Chatham-Kent

Community Development

Planning Services

To: Mayor and Members of Council

From: Ryan Jacques, MCIP, RPP
Director, Planning Services

Date: May 31, 2021

Subject: Ontario Heritage Act - Part IV (Designation of Properties by Municipalities)
30 Ellwood Avenue, Community of Chatham (City)

This report is for the information of Council.

Background

Our inheritance of architecture and cultural landscapes is an irreplaceable asset and resource. In Ontario, the task of conserving these important assets is primarily a municipal responsibility. The Ontario Heritage Act provides a framework within which municipalities can act to identify and conserve properties of historical and/or architectural significance.

Council has established the Municipal Heritage Committee (MHC) to advise Council on heritage matters. Under provision 1.1.3 of its Terms of Reference, the MHC has a specific role of advising Council on requests to designate a property under Part IV of the OHA. In Chatham-Kent, such requests are typically initiated by the property owner and a designation report outlining the historical and/or architectural value of the property is reviewed by the MHC prior to advising Council on the matter. It is most often that these requests involve properties holding substantial merit for designation.

In 2019, the owner of 30 Ellwood Avenue initiated a request for designation of the property.

At its May 15, 2019 meeting, the MHC reviewed an initial draft of the Heritage Designation Report for 30 Ellwood Avenue, and passed a motion recommending that Council designate the property under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act for its cultural heritage value or interest. At its meeting held on May 19, 2021 the Committee reiterated its support for property designation, and adopted the final revised designation report. A copy of the Heritage Designation Report is attached as Appendix A.

Comments

Planning Services provides administrative support to the MHC. Through the Committee's Terms of Reference, Planning Services has the responsibility to present the recommendations or advice of the MHC to Council through the creation of reports.

Cultural Heritage Evaluation

The property owner, who is also a member of the MHC, co-authored the Designation Report for 30 Ellwood Avenue. The report outlines the basis for the Committee's recommendation to designate this property. The Report contains a statement explaining the cultural heritage value or interest of the property, and a description of the property's attributes.

In order for a property to be considered for designation under the Ontario Heritage Act, it must meet at least one of the three criteria defined under Ontario Regulation 9/06 – Criteria for Determining Cultural Heritage Value or Interest. Council may designate the property under Part IV if one of these criteria is met. The criteria include three overarching values within which are nine sub-criteria.

In considering the content of the Designation Report, Administration has determined that the cultural heritage value or interest of this property is inconclusive in meeting the criteria set out under the Ontario Heritage Act. This determination is based on the following:

The first set of criteria relate to the Architectural/Design Value of the property. These include:

- a. Is the property a rare, unique, representative or early example of a style, type, expression, material or construction method;
- b. Does the property display a high degree of craftsmanship or artistic merit;
or,
- c. Does the property demonstrate a high degree of technical or scientific achievement?

The residential structure contained on 30 Ellwood Avenue is of an architectural design and character seen throughout Chatham-Kent. More specifically, it shares similar built characteristics of other properties along Ellwood Avenue. Therefore, it is not clear that the property represents a rare and/or unique expression or design, displays a high degree of craftsmanship or artistic merit, or demonstrates a high degree of technical or scientific achievement.

The next set of criteria relate to the Associative/Historical Value of the property. These include:

- a. Does the property have direct associations with a theme, event, belief, person, activity, organization or institution that is significant to a community;
- b. Does the property yield, or have the potential to yield information that contributes to an understanding of a community or culture; or,
- c. Does the property demonstrate or reflect the work or ideas of an architect, artist, builder, designer or theorist who is significant to a community?

The designation report does not detail associative/historical value expected of a designated property in Chatham-Kent.

Lastly, the third criteria relate to the Contextual Value of the property, including the following:

- a. Is the property important in defining, maintaining or supporting the character of an area;
- b. Is the property physically, functionally, visually or historically linked to its surrounding; or,
- c. Is the property a landmark?

Contextually, this property is part of an historic area of Chatham-Kent. Several designated properties with high contextual value are located within blocks of 30 Ellwood Avenue. These include, but are not limited to:

- 44 William Street North (The Chatham Armoury)
- 50 William Street North (Tecumseh Park)
- 3 Stanley Avenue
- 85 Stanley Street (Kent County Courthouse)
- 77-79 Lansdowne Avenue
- 59 William Street North (Milner House)
- 75 William Street North (Chatham Cultural Centre)
- Light Standards on Ellwood Avenue and Murray Street

There are also several properties in the area that are not designated but are Listed in the Chatham-Kent Municipal Heritage Register for their historical significance. 30 Ellwood Avenue is not Listed on the Municipal Heritage Register.

Based on this analysis, Administration is not recommending that 30 Ellwood Avenue be designated under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act. The designation report does set out the significance of the property. However, there is not compelling evidence

demonstrating that the property is significant to the community, and in turn, warranting protection to serve the broader public interest.

Council has options regarding this matter, which are outlined as follows:

- 1) Accept this Report as information. No action will be taken and the property is not designated.
- 2) Proceed with the designation. Notice of Intention to Designate is then served. If there are no objection(s), the final request to designate comes back to Council. Should there be an objection(s), there is an appeal process to the Conservation Review Board before the final request comes back to Council for final decision.

Consultation

The Municipal Heritage Committee (MHC) was consulted in accordance with Section 29(2) of the Act. The MHC passed the following motion on May 19, 2021 regarding this property:

“That the revised designation report for 30 Ellwood Avenue, Chatham written by Bert Duclos replace the previous report and move forward to Council for designation.”

The revised designation report referred to is attached as Appendix A.

Financial Implications

Designation under the Act is an eligibility requirement of the Heritage Property Tax Relief Program. Should Council choose Designation of this property under the Act, and the property owner meets all of the eligibility requirements of the program, they may be entitled to a prescribed level of tax relief starting with the 2021 tax year. The level of eligible tax relief for a residential property is 25%.

Prepared by:


Ryan Jacques, MCIP, RPP
Director, Planning Services

Reviewed by:


Bruce McAllister, MCIP, RPP
General Manager,
Community Development

Attachments: Appendix A – Designation Report: 30 Ellwood Avenue, Community of Chatham (City)

c. Municipal Heritage Committee

P:\RTC\Community Development\2021\Planning Services\Jun 14-21 Ontario Heritage Act - 30 Ellwood Avenue Report.docx

Designation Report

**30 Ellwood Avenue
Chatham**

Declaration: My name is Susan Simpson and I am the property owner of 30 Ellwood Avenue, Chatham. I am also a Municipal Heritage Committee member.

Preamble:

The property at 30 Ellwood Avenue, Chatham is a good example of an evolving middle class residence from the 1920s, combining both Beaux Arts and Mission elements. The second storey gives the appearance of being one large dormer, however, the interior walls of the rooms are full ceiling height. The second storey would presumably have been clad with wood, however, it is now clad with aluminum siding, possibly added during the middle of the twentieth century.

There are sixteen original windows on the main floor and nine double hung replacement windows on the second floor. Double hung replacement windows were chosen as the originals were, in all likelihood, double hung. The window replacements used the original window openings and emulate the original muntin bar patterns.

The side lights flanking the front door are original, however, the front door is newly crafted. Created by local carpenter Brad Miller, who specializes in heritage restorations, the craftsmanship shows in the alignment of the windows and door panels with the sidelight windows and panels.

The front porch, covered with flagstone, very likely altered from its original construction, has wrought iron railings. It is possible that the original porch may have resembled either of the porches on the neighbouring homes where stone or brick has been used to extend the porch creating two levels with plinths at the front of the porch. Urns, dating to the 1920s were left with the house and were possibly designed for display on the original plinths at the front of the porch.

Unlike the majority of Beaux Arts homes seen in Chatham-Kent, the sunroom extension is situated at the rear of the house as opposed to the side. This may be the result of the home being constructed after the neighbouring residences were built. The lot at 30 Ellwood includes part lots from each of the adjoining properties. A second storey addition was built above the sunroom, possibly during the 1980s. Garden doors from the second storey bedroom lead onto a small balcony with a metal spiral staircase. An earlier alteration to the sunroom windows and garden doors took place in the 1990s where the original windows and doors were retained while replacement windows and doors were added on the outside.

A 2017 renovation was completed on the roofline of the kitchen nook where an acrylic ceiling, added during the 1990s, was removed. Bricks saved from the earlier renovation were used to complete a period sensitive restoration. The kitchen nook as well as the sun room is built over crawlspaces whereas the remainder of the main floor living space has a full basement below.

There is a small bump-out clad in aluminum that extends from the dining room on the west wall. Its interior has an arched ceiling and was possibly designed for the placement of a dining room sideboard to hold dishes, silverware and table cloths.

Designation Report

**30 Ellwood Avenue
Chatham**

Legal Description

30 Ellwood Avenue, Chatham

Lot 36 Plan 377, Pt. lot 35, 37 Plan 377 as in 197419 in the City of Chatham, Municipality of Chatham-Kent

Description of Property

The 30 Ellwood Avenue property, located on the south side of Ellwood Avenue, west of Prince Street N., consists of a 1927 brick residence with Beaux Arts and Mission/Arts & Crafts influence.

Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest

The property at 30 Ellwood Avenue's design or physical cultural heritage value is reflected in it being a good example of an evolving middle class, two storey residence. Built in 1927, it is an amalgamation of Beaux Arts and Mission influences demonstrated by Mission corbels supporting an arched portico over a centrally located main door framed with two sidelights each with two over seven panes of glue chipped glass and crowned with an intricate fantail. The influence of British architect Charles Voysey is suggested by several features including heart motifs on decorative shutters and the use of groupings or banks of windows. The embossing on the coal chute surface identifies it as being manufactured by the Galt Stove and Furnace Company Limited, Galt, Ontario.

The property at 30 Ellwood Avenue's contextual cultural heritage value lies in its importance in supporting the diverse character of a residential streetscape of the first quarter of the twentieth century. Its Beaux Arts and Mission style contributes to the streetscape's evolving and diverse range of residential styles (Arts & Crafts, Edwardian Four Square, Classical Revival, Bungalow, etc.) that represent prosperous middle class taste of the early 1900s that was a distinct departure from the eccentric and asymmetric architecture of the Victorian era.

Description of Heritage Attributes

Key attributes of 30 Ellwood Avenue that reflect its design and physical value as a good example of an evolving middle class residence and its contextual value in contributing to the streetscape's evolving residential architectural styles include:

- roofline combining a gable peak and a decorative gambrel
- return eaves on northeast and southwest corners
- decorative jetty on front façade
- running bond polychromatic of mottled, heavily textured, black, brown, tan and red brick on first storey

Designation Report

**30 Ellwood Avenue
Chatham**

Description of Heritage Attributes Continued

- frieze board under decorative jetty on all four sides of the home
- asymmetric U-shaped footprint
- poured concrete foundation
- two bump-out extensions on the west and south sides of the house
- single stack brick chimney with coal chute on east exterior wall
- front door framed by sidelights including Glue Chip glass
- wood fantail above front door
- wood Mission style corbels supporting metal covered semicircular portico
- tongue & groove wooden inner surface finish on portico
- bank of three 3 over 3 double hung original windows symmetrically balanced on both sides of the front door
- two sets of 2 over 2 shutter style windows with original brass hardware flanking the chimney
- undecorated stone lug window sills
- location of building on the south side of Ellwood Avenue

Designation Report

**30 Ellwood Avenue
Chatham**

Terms:

- Glue Chip Glass- Glass that has been etched and covered in warm hide glue. As the glue cools, it attaches to the rough glass. As the glue dries, it shrinks and tears thin shards from the surface in a fern-like random pattern.
- Jetty - A jetty is a projecting part of a building, such as the upper storey of a house or a bay window. The jetty on the façade of 30 Ellwood is located at the midpoint between the first and second storeys and projects 24 inches from the vertical elevation. The upper side of this jetty is clad in roofing shingles.
- Muntin - A secondary framing member to hold panes within a window
- Plinth- A solid square or rectangular base often ornamented to support a statue or monument.

Resources:

The following authorities were consulted: Lisa Gilbert, Dave Benson, John Rhodes and Bertrand Duclos.

In 2019 personal conversations took place with local authors and historians, Lisa Gilbert and John Rhodes. Correspondence with Dave Benson, former Director of the Chatham-Kent Museum took place via email in April 2019 where Dave Benson revised and rewrote the original designation report.

In May 2021, Bertrand Duclos, Heritage Outreach Consultant, Culture Services Unit, Ministry of Tourism, Culture and Sport, Government of Ontario, rewrote and revised both the deputation to Council as well as the Designation report. His amendments to the files are intended to facilitate the meeting of the requirements of section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act and best practices of clear and objective designation reports leading to a potential designation bylaw.

References:

Blumenson, John. Ontario Architecture: A Guide to Styles and Building Terms 1784-Present. Fitzhenry & Whiteside, 1990.

Harris, Cyril, Illustrated Dictionary of Historic Architecture. Dover Publications, 1983.

Lauriston, Victor. Romantic Kent, The Story of a County, 1626-1952. Chatham Ontario: Self-Published, 1952.

Vernon's City Directories 1876 – 2005.