

**Municipality of Chatham-Kent**

**Infrastructure and Engineering Services**

**Engineering and Transportation Division**

**To:** Mayor and Members of Council

**From:** Brendan Falkner, P.Eng.  
Manager, Engineering (Roads and Bridges)

**Date:** September 1, 2020

**Subject:** R20-291 – Engineering Services for the Road Rehabilitation of Grand Avenue East – Community of Chatham

---

**Recommendations**

It is recommended that:

1. The engineering assignment for R20-291 Engineering Services for the Road Rehabilitation of Grand Avenue East – Community of Chatham be awarded to Dillon Consulting Limited in the amount of \$552,903.35 including HST.
2. The Mayor and Clerk be authorized to enter into the recommended agreements.

**Background**

The Municipality of Chatham-Kent Council at its November 18, 2019 Council meeting, approved the resolution for the submission of the road rehabilitation of Grand Avenue East between Taylor Avenue and Communication Road for consideration under the Ministry of Transportation (MTO) Connecting Links Program.

Through the Connecting Links Program, the Province of Ontario is investing a total of \$40 million in 2020-2021 for the construction and repair of roads and bridges on connecting links. As part of Ontario's Action Plan: Responding to COVID-19, an additional \$10 million in funding was added to the program.

As a result of this extra funding the Municipality was notified on June 30, 2020 that the application had been selected. Under this program the Ministry will provide funding up to 90 percent to a maximum of \$3 million of eligible costs for approved projects. As a result of the additional funding being added to the program, the Municipality was successful in obtaining approval for the full \$3 million dollars in funding to apply towards this project. The funding model under this program is 90% from the MTO for eligible projects costs (up to \$3 million dollars). The Municipality is required to contribute the remaining 10% of eligible project costs and pay for all ineligible project costs.

Due to the short timeline and lack of internal resources, a Request for Proposal was issued by the Engineering and Transportation Division for the associated engineering design, inspections, and contract administration through the use of consulting engineering services to complete this project.

**Comments**

The project consists of the road rehabilitation of Grand Avenue East from east of Taylor Avenue to the Canadian Pacific Railway west of Communication Road. These improvements consist of full asphalt pavement replacement, curb & gutter, subdrains, catch basins, left turn lane at Michener Road and the replacement of Arnold Creek culvert over Running Creek.

Six (6) separate proposals were received by the Purchasing Officer on Wednesday, August 26, 2020 and forwarded to Engineering and Transportation Division for review and evaluation by the evaluation panel using the Council approved evaluation matrix as provided in the proposal call to all submitting firms.

The proposals were received using a two-envelope system with the fee schedule submitted in a separate envelope opened by the panel only after the ratings had been determined.

Table 1: Evaluation Matrix

<b>Qualification Category</b>	<b>Qualification Criteria</b>	<b>Weighting</b>
<b><i>Experience and Qualifications of the Project Team</i></b>	Project Manager and Senior Designers	18
	Technical Support Staff Design	10
	Contract Administration & Tech Support	8
<b><i>Management Qualifications</i></b>	Experience on Similar Projects	15
	Availability of Key Staff	5
	Local Office	3
<b><i>Project Implementation</i></b>	Approach and Methodology	15
	Scheduling / Understanding Key Activities	12
	Project Quality Assurance	12
<b><i>Price</i></b>	Project Fee	42
	<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>140</b>

Due to the complexity of the project and the specialized nature of the work that was required to complete this project the respondents were required to achieve a 70% grade threshold. Submissions must score at least 70% of the maximum on the evaluation matrix to have their fee envelope opened. Failure to achieve this grade will result in a non-compliant submission.

Table 2: Summary of Evaluation Scores

Rank	Submitting Firm	Office Location	Final Score
1.	Dillon Consulting Limited	Chatham, ON	1153.7
2.	MTE Consultants Inc.	London, ON	1140.8
3.	PML Consultants Ltd.	Toronto, ON	853.9
4.	Stril, Baldinelli, Moniz Ltd.	London, ON	N/C
5.	BT Engineering Inc.	London, ON	N/C
6.	WT Infrastructure	Guelph, ON	N/C

\* The submission was non-compliant.

Three of the proposals submitted adhered to the requested content of the RFP. The submissions from Stril, Baldinelli, Moniz Ltd, BT Engineering Inc. and WT Infrastructure were deemed to be non-compliant, therefore their financial proposals were not opened.

The proposal submitted by Dillon Consulting Limited illustrated the staffing resources, methodology and quality controls necessary to initiate and successfully complete the project. Based on the panel review process, the proposal submitted by Dillon Consulting was deemed to be the preferred submission ranked highest by the panel.

### **Areas of Strategic Focus and Critical Success Factors**

The recommendations in this report support the following areas of strategic focus:

- Economic Prosperity:  
Chatham-Kent is an innovative and thriving community with a diversified economy
- A Healthy and Safe Community: Chatham-Kent is a healthy and safe community with sustainable population growth
- People and Culture:  
Chatham-Kent is recognized as a culturally vibrant, dynamic, and creative community
- Environmental Sustainability:  
Chatham-Kent is a community that is environmentally sustainable and promotes stewardship of our natural resources

The recommendations in this report support the following critical success factors:

- Financial Sustainability:  
The Corporation of the Municipality of Chatham-Kent is financially sustainable
- Open, Transparent and Effective Governance:  
The Corporation of the Municipality of Chatham-Kent is open, transparent and effectively governed with efficient and bold, visionary leadership
- Has the potential to support all areas of strategic focus & critical success factors
- Neutral issues (does not support negatively or positively)

### **Consultation**

The Tenders were opened by the Purchasing Officer and reviewed by the Engineering and Transportation Division, Infrastructure and Engineering Services.

### **Financial Implications**

The recommendations in this report have an associated financial implication of \$552,903.35 in consulting fees. This fee covers all aspects of the project from the completion of the engineering design, and contract administration.

The consulting fees identified shall be funded through the approved Connecting Links Funding Program and the Bridge Lifecycle Reserve.

Table 3: Project Cost and Funding Summary

<b>Description</b>	<b>Total</b>
<b>A) Project Costs</b>	
Low Tender Bid w HST 13%	\$ 552,903.35
Less HST Rebate 11.24%	-\$54,996.76
<b>Total Project Cost</b>	<b>\$ 497,906.59</b>
<b>B) Project Funding</b>	
Connecting Link Funding	\$ 400,000.00
Bridge Lifecycle Reserve	\$97,906.59
<b>Total Project Funding</b>	<b>\$ 497,906.59</b>

Prepared by:

Reviewed by:

---

Barry Sullivan, C.E.T., rcsi  
Engineering Technologist  
Engineering and Transportation

---

Brendan Falkner, P.Eng.  
Manager, Engineering  
Engineering and Transportation

Reviewed by:

Reviewed by:

---

Chris Thibert, P.Eng.  
Director, Engineering  
Engineering and Transportation

---

Thomas Kelly, P.Eng., MBA  
General Manager  
Infrastructure and Engineering Services

Consulted and confirmed the content of the consultation section of the report by:

---

Jennifer Scherle  
Purchasing Officer

Attachments: None

RTC:\Infrastructure & Engineering\I&ES\2020\4292 – R20-291 Request for Proposals  
Engineering Services for the Road Rehabilitation of Grand Avenue East Community of  
Chatham